NCUTCD Proposal for Changes to the
Manual on Uniform Traffic Control Devices

TECHNICAL COMMITTEE: Regulatory and Warning Signs Technical Committee and Signals Technical Committee
ITEM NUMBER: 18B-RW-02
TOPIC: R10-YY, LEFT (RIGHT) TURN YIELD ON FLASHING YELLOW ARROW signs for signals with permissive left (right) turns

ORIGIN OF REQUEST: Pooled Fund Study (December 2017) and RW and SIG Technical Committees Joint Task force: Bob Seyfried RWSTC (chair), Erin Kissner (RWSTC), Lee Roadifer (RWSTC), Jeff Wolfe (RWSTC), Robert Weber (RWSTC), and Gerry DeCamp (STC)

AFFECTED SECTIONS OF MUTCD: Sections 2B.53

DEVELOPMENT HISTORY:
- Task force: 6-20-18, revised 11-21-18, revised 1-9-19
- Approved by RW Technical Committee: 06/20/2018
- Approved by SIGNAL Technical Committee 06/20/2018
- Approved by RW Technical Committee following sponsor comments: 01/09/2019
- Approved by SIGNAL Technical Committee following sponsor comments: NA
- Approved by NCUTCD Council: 01/10/2019

This is a proposal for recommended changes to the MUTCD that has been approved by the NCUTCD Council. This proposal does not represent a revision of the MUTCD and does not constitute official MUTCD standards, guidance, or options. It will be submitted to FHWA for consideration for inclusion in a future MUTCD revision. The MUTCD can be revised only through the federal rulemaking process.

SUMMARY:
The Traffic Control Devices Pooled Fund Study (TCD PFS) focused on a systematic evaluation of novel traffic control devices (TCDs), employing a process that addressed human factors and operations issues for each TCD idea. As part of the TCD PFS effort, the Federal Highway Administration (FHWA) Human Factors Team evaluated both existing and proposed traffic signs. Sets of sign alternatives were evaluated for driver comprehension and legibility. For some sets, participants were also asked to rank the effectiveness of the alternatives.
The LEFT (RIGHT) TURN YIELD ON FLASHING YELLOW sign is intended to be used to inform drivers that they are expected to yield at a flashing yellow traffic signal. It is challenging to adequately convey dynamic “flashing” in a static symbol. The Pooled Fund Study investigated the most appropriate symbol to portray a flashing yellow arrow. Although the Pooled Fund Study limited its evaluation to only left turn applications for such a sign, the Joint Task Force considered it reasonable to make such a sign also applicable to right turns on flashing yellow arrows where it is desired to remind turning drivers to yield to pedestrians in the crosswalk or to U-turns on the cross street.

**DISCUSSION**

The following table presents all alternatives for the flashing yellow arrow sign that were evaluated by the Pooled Fund Study. In each case, the alternative sign was placed next to the appropriate signal face. A condition in which no sign was placed next to the signal face was also included. This was designed to provide insight as to whether or not the sign is necessary to properly interpret the signal.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Alt. 1</th>
<th>Alt. 2</th>
<th>Alt. 3</th>
<th>Alt. 4</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>LEFT TURN YIELD ON FLASHING YELLOW ARROW</td>
<td>LEFT TURN YIELD ON FLASHING</td>
<td>LEFT TURN YIELD ON FLASHING</td>
<td>(no sign)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Comprehension**

Participants were only exposed to a single Flashing Yellow Arrow sign and were asked “Imagine you are driving and encounter this sign. You want to make a left turn and are positioned in the proper lane. How would you proceed?” The sign was placed in context next to the signal face on the mast arm. The yellow arrow was presented as flashing, in a solid state, and blank. Open ended responses were coded as a response including the acknowledgement that the driver did not have the right of way and needed to yield to oncoming traffic, as a need to use caution only, or some other response.

Participant responses as percentages are presented in Table 12. When exploring all data, no significant differences between sign alternatives were found, nor was there a significant interaction between the flashing state of the signal mast and the sign alternative (p > .05). However, the flashing state of the signal was found to significantly affect response. Significantly more people who saw the animated flashing yellow arrow verbally indicated that they did not have the right of way and needed to yield to oncoming traffic (p < .05). This result lends one to believe that the flashing of the light itself carries meaning to drivers.
Next, participants were told the intended meaning of the flashing yellow arrow sign. The three sign alternatives were presented (i.e., no blank sign was shown for ranking) and participants were asked to rank them in terms of perceived effectiveness. When considering only the top choice indicated by the participants (Ranking = 1), alternative 3 was selected as the top choice by 47.5 percent (95/200) of the participants and alternative 2 was selected as the top choice by 34 percent (68/200) of the participants. There was a significant difference in the rankings of each alternative $\chi^2 (4) = 121.44, p < .001$. Alternative 1 (all text) was consistently rated the least effective sign ($p < .05$).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Flashing state</th>
<th>Sign Alternative</th>
<th>Yield to oncoming traffic %</th>
<th>Use Caution Only %</th>
<th>Other %</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Off</td>
<td>Alt. 1</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Alt. 2</td>
<td>65</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Alt. 3</td>
<td>75</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Alt. 4</td>
<td>65</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>On (steady)</td>
<td>Alt. 1</td>
<td>65</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Alt. 2</td>
<td>75</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Alt. 3</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Alt. 4</td>
<td>45</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Animated (flashing)</td>
<td>Alt. 1</td>
<td>70</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Alt. 2</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Alt. 3</td>
<td>85</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Alt. 4</td>
<td>70</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

![Graph showing percentage of participants selecting each sign alternative at each ranking value.]

**Figure 2. The percentage of participants selecting each sign alternative at each ranking value.**
Legibility
Mean legibility response distances are presented in Table 13. Mean response distance did not vary significantly by sign alternative $F(2) = .80$, MSe = 3455.212, $p > .05$. In other words, all signs were read at a similar distance.

**Table 13. Mean response distance by sign alternative.**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Alternative</th>
<th>Mean Distance (ft)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Alt. 1</td>
<td>376.07</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alt. 2</td>
<td>379.38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alt. 3</td>
<td>389.97</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Summary Findings for Flashing Yellow Arrow
There were no significant differences between sign alternatives, nor was there a significant interaction between the flashing state of the signal face and sign alternative. Regardless of sign alternative or flashing state, between 75-100 percent of participants reported that the driver needed to yield to oncoming traffic or use caution; this was also true for participants who viewed alternative 4 (no sign), signifying that even with no sign at all, people would either choose to yield to oncoming traffic or use caution. The results also indicated that significantly more people who saw the animated flashing yellow arrow verbally indicated that they did not have the right of way and needed to yield to oncoming traffic. This is important because it suggests that the flashing light carries meaning to drivers.

When considering the participant rankings of the signs, participants generally preferred alternative 3 and alternative 2 over alternative 1. All three signs had similar legibility distances. Although there were no statistically significant differences, more participants selected alternative 3 as their top choice than those who selected alternative 2, and alternative 3 also had a slightly longer legibility distance (though, again, not significant).

With only 70 percent of participants reporting that they need to yield to oncoming traffic when viewing the animated flashing yellow arrow with no sign, the Pooled Fund Study concluded that it may be premature to not use a sign at all. However, there may be a point in the future where the signs will not be needed, or can be removed after a certain period of time. Alternative 3 or alternative 2 are both acceptable signs to use.

As a result, it is recommended that a LEFT (RIGHT) TURN YIELD ON FLASHING YELLOW sign be added to the MUTCD for optional use in conjunction with flashing left-turn YELLOW ARROW and flashing right-turn YELLOW ARROW signal faces. Because alternatives 2 and 3 performed approximately equally, either could be used. However, because Alternative 2 had 100% correct responses when used in conjunction with a flashing yellow arrow, it is recommended by the Task Force for addition to the MUTCD.

Although the RIGHT TURN YIELD ON FLASHING YELLOW sign was not considered in the pooled fund study, the task force believes that the message is sufficiently similar to the LEFT TURN YIELD ON FLASHING YELLOW sign to warrant its inclusion in the recommended MUTCD changes. This sign could be useful at locations where a flashing yellow arrow is
desirable to indicate to right-turning motorists that they must yield to pedestrians or U-turning vehicles.

RECOMMENDED MUTCD CHANGES

The following present the proposed changes to the current MUTCD within the context of the current MUTCD language. Proposed additions to the MUTCD are shown in blue underline and proposed deletions from the MUTCD are shown in red strikethrough. Changes previously approved by NCUTCD Council (but not yet adopted by FHWA) are shown in green double underline for additions and green double strikethrough for deletions. In some cases, background comments may be provided with the MUTCD text. These comments are indicated by [highlighted light blue in brackets].

Chapter 2B. REGULATORY SIGNS, BARRICADES, AND GATES

Section 2B.53 Traffic Signal Signs (R10-5 through R10-30, R10-XX, R10-YY)

Option:

01 To supplement traffic signal control, Traffic Signal signs R10-5 through R10-30, R10-YY may be used to regulate road users (see Figure 2B-27).

02 Traffic Signal signs (see Figure 2B-27) may be installed at certain locations to clarify signal control. Among the legends that may be used for this purpose are: LEFT ON GREEN ARROW ONLY (R10-5), STOP HERE ON RED (R10-6 or R10-6a) for observance of stop lines, DO NOT BLOCK INTERSECTION (R10-7) for avoidance of traffic obstructions, USE LANE(S) WITH GREEN ARROW (R10-8) for obedience to lane use control signals (see Chapter 4M), LEFT TURN YIELD ON GREEN (symbolic circular green) (R10-12), and LEFT TURN YIELD ON FLASHING RED ARROW AFTER STOP (R10-27). Change the above list of legends from paragraph format to a bulleted list for better clarity and insert the new LEFT (RIGHT) TURN YIELD ON FLASHING (symbolic yellow arrow) sign below:

- LEFT ON GREEN ARROW ONLY (R10-5),
- STOP HERE ON RED (R10-6 or R10-6a),
- DO NOT BLOCK INTERSECTION (R10-7),
- USE LANE(S) WITH GREEN ARROW (R10-8), (see Chapter 4M),
- LEFT TURN YIELD ON GREEN (symbolic circular green) (R10-12),
- LEFT (RIGHT) TURN YIELD ON FLASHING (symbolic yellow arrow)
- (R10-YY or R10-YYa), or
- LEFT (RIGHT) TURN YIELD ON FLASHING RED ARROW AFTER STOP (R10-27 or R10-27a)

Guidance:

03 If used, the LEFT ON GREEN ARROW ONLY (R10-5) sign, the LEFT TURN YIELD ON GREEN (symbolic circular green) (R10-12) sign, LEFT TURN YIELD ON FLASHING (symbolic yellow arrow) (R10-YY) sign, or the LEFT TURN YIELD ON FLASHING RED ARROW AFTER STOP (R10-27) sign should be located adjacent to the left-turn signal face. If used, the RIGHT TURN YIELD ON FLASHING (symbolic yellow arrow) (R10-YYa), or the RIGHT TURN YIELD ON FLASHING RED ARROW AFTER STOP (R10-27a) sign should be located adjacent to the right-turn signal face.
Option:
04 If needed for additional emphasis, **any of the signs described in paragraph 02 above an** additional LEFT TURN YIELD ON GREEN (symbolic circular green) (R10-12) sign with an
AT SIGNAL (R10-31P) supplemental plaque (see Figure 2B-27) may be installed in advance of
the intersection.
05 In situations where traffic control signals are coordinated for progressive timing, the Traffic
Signal Speed (I1-1) sign may be used (see Section 2H.03).

Standard:
06 The CROSSWALK STOP ON RED (symbolic circular red) (R10-23) sign (see Figure
2B-27) shall only be used in conjunction with pedestrian hybrid beacons (see Section
4F.02).
07 The EMERGENCY SIGNAL (R10-13) sign (see Figure 2B-27) shall be used in
conjunction with emergency-vehicle traffic control signals (see Section 4G.02).
08 The EMERGENCY SIGNAL—STOP ON FLASHING RED (R10-14 or R10-14a) sign
(see Figure 2B-27) shall be used in conjunction with emergency-vehicle hybrid beacons (see
Section 4G.04).

Option:
09 In order to remind drivers who are making turns **at a signalized intersection** to yield to or
**stop for** pedestrians, a Turning Vehicles Yield to **(Stop for)** Pedestrians (R10-15, R10-15a) sign
(see Figure 2B-27) may be used.

Standard:
09a The Turning Vehicles Stop for Pedestrians (R10-15a) sign shall only be used in
jurisdictions where laws, ordinances or resolutions specifically require that a driver must
**stop for a pedestrian.** (approved by Council 1/06/2017)

Option:
10 A U-TURN YIELD TO RIGHT TURN (R10-16) sign (see Figure 2B-27) may be installed
near the left-turn signal face if U-turns are allowed on a protected left-turn movement on an
approach from which a right-turn GREEN ARROW signal indication is simultaneously being
displayed to drivers making a right turn from the conflicting approach to their left.
10a A U-TURN SIGNAL (R10-XX) sign (see Figure 2B-27) may be installed adjacent to the
signal face that exclusively controls a u-turn movement. (approved by Council 6/20/2009)

ADD sign R10-15a to Figure 2B.27. Add * fluorescent yellow-green background color may
be used instead of yellow for this sign. (approved by Council 1-6-2017)
Add the following sign to Figure 2B-27:

LEFT (RIGHT) TURN YIELD ON FLASHING (symbolic yellow arrow) sign (R10-YY or R10-YYa)