1 2 3



ATTACHMENT NO. 4

<u>RW # 5</u>

National Committee on Uniform Traffic Control Devices

17200 West Bell Road No.1135 * Surprise, Ariz. 85374 Telephone (623) 214-2403 * e-mail: ncutcd@aol.com

4 5	National Committee on Uniform Traffic Control Devices			
6	RWSTC			
7				
8 9 10				
		RWSTC ager	nda item III.5, January 2014	
11			No. 10. 10. 10. 10. 10. 10. 10. 10. 10. 10	
12 13	TECHNICAL COMMITTEE:	R&W Signs Technical C	ommittee	
14	DATE OF ACTION (TASK FORCE):	6-11-13, revised 12-22-	13 following sponsor	
15		comments		
16	RWSTC APPROVAL:	6-27-13		
17	TRANSMITTAL TO SPONSORS:	November 2013		
18	RWSTC APPROVAL DATE:	1-8-14		
19	COUNCIL APPROVAL:	1-10-14		
20				
21	ORIGIN OF REQUEST:	EV Task Force		
22		Randy McCourt – chair		
		Tom Heydel Lee Roadifer	Rich Meredith Michael Moule	
		Mark Bott	Bob Canfield	
23		Mark Bott	Dob Carmola	
24	TOPIC:	Electrical Vehicle (EV) Signs		
25			-	
26	AFFECTED SECTIONS OF MUTCD:	Section 2B.46, 2B.47 a	and Figure 2B-24	
27	0			
28	SUMMARY:			
29	Electric vehicle (EV) parking signs have been emerging throughout the country with little			
30 31	uniformity, consistency, or any study of recognition of the best way to convey the restrictions and regulations intended. FHWA provided interim approval of a symbol for			
32	EV and there has been substantial activities by states in implement EV initiatives			
33	including the provision of uniform signing. The task force objective was to find the best,			
34	more consistent and uniform signs for reserving parking for charging EVs both on-street			
35	and off-street.		5 <u>5</u> <u>-</u>	
36				

37 **RESEARCH**:

The following publications have been reviewed relative to these added requirements:

- Traffic Control Devices Pooled Fund Study: Design and Evaluation of Selected
 Symbol Signs Phase II Final Report, FHWA, by SAIC, May 2008.
 - "Traffic Control Devices Pooled Fund Study: Design and Evaluation of Selected Symbol Signs Phase II Final Report, FHWA, by SAIC, November 2010.
- Interim Approval for Optional Use of an Alternative Electric Vehicle Charging
 General Services Symbol Sign, FHWA, HOTO-1, April 1, 2011.
- *Ready Set Charge A Guide to EV-Ready Communities*, Association of Bay Area Governments, 2011.
 - Lessons Learned The EV Project EVSE Signage, US Department of Energy, by ECOtality, April 2012.
 - Zi-128 EV Internationally recognized Symbol Final Approval, British Columbia Ministry of Transportation and Infrastructure, November 2012.
- *Zero-Emissions Vehicle Signage Information*, redacted from the 2012 ZEV Action
 Plan, State of California, Governor's Office of Planning and Research, October
 2012; as part of California Traffic Control Devices Committee meeting December
 6, 2012.
 - *Electric Vehicle Sign Comprehension*, CE454 Urban Transportation Studies Group Project, Portland State University, December 2012.
 - *Bill ESSB 5849,* Washington State House of Representatives Office of Program Research, Transportation Committee, March 2013.
 - Evaluation of Electric Vehicle Signage, Portland State University, June 2013.
- 60 61

42

43

48

49

50

51

56 57

58

59

62 63

DISCUSSION: On April 1, 2011 FHWA issued interim approval for the use
 of an Alternative Electric Vehicle Charging General Service Symbol Sign.
 The content of that approval focuses on the D9-11 series type sign and
 section 2I.02. However, the appropriate application of the sign is wayfinding
 not regulation of on-street and off-street parking spaces for sites open to



69 public travel. The use of a blue sign to regulate parking space designation is not 70 appropriate. This issue has been taken up by several western states, Canada and is 71 relevant given the emerging development of EVs. However, most of these efforts 72 represented individual or narrow committee recommendations without substantive 73 research to determine what is the most recognizable message for this task – similar to 74 the work done between 2008 and 2010 by FHWA as part of the pooled fund studies to 75 determine the general service sign.

76

Following discussion of this topic at RWTC meetings in June 2012 and January 2013, the task force worked with Portland State University to conduct two human factors evaluations to determine what sign had the best recognition through research, making use of prior studies and sign messages. The first effort was undertaken by students to independently assess (through a class project overseen by Dr. Chris Monsere) if there was confusion in the messaging. It was found that there was confusion. This led to a 83 more detailed human factors survey effort conducted by students (through a class 84 project overseen by Dr. Kelly Clifton, led by Deanna George & Benjamin Stolt) that 85 emulated the pooled fund research effort to guide the development of the most 86 recognizable sign.

- 87
- 88 The December 2012 PSU studies were cursory human factors efforts but it provided the 89 following general findings:
- 90

95

96

97

98

99

100

- More is less no sign should have multiple plaques unless they are addressing separate issues (like pay to park and EV). The two word reserved parking seemed to fare well although several of the surveys compared it to conditions that it was not intended to address.
 - 2. The EV symbol did well and had a 87% recognition that the symbol did NOT include hybrids.
 - 3. If limits to parking are to be for charging activity the word charging will need to be included.
 - No parking as a sign to indicate restricted parking for EV appears to be confusing between surveys with ranging results - mixed messaging
- 5. When it is not simply reserved EV parking (the MUTCD prototype from the handicap parking example seems to work well there), how multiple components are assembled for EV vs general parking, charging vs not charging, time limits, pay to park needs more consideration
- 105

109

110 111

112

The June 2013 PSU Study was a more detailed effort focused on the EV parking sign
concepts for on-street and off-street parking, providing the following findings:

- 1. Use of no parking symbols to restrict parking for EVs confuses road users as to the message to park or not park
- 2. Use of the words "charging only" clarified the regulatory requirement that a vehicle must be charging (not just an EV) to utilize the space
- The use multiple colored signs seemed to have higher recognition (green and black on white) which may outweigh the costs/complexity of multiple color production
- 116 4. Use of arrows on these signs confused users
- 5. The two signs below had the best recognition for addressing EV parking
 restrictions for off-street and on-street conditions. Key findings include:





- 119
- 120 121

122

The use of the black EV symbol outperformed the blue or green for the reserved parking

- 123 124
- 125
- 126 127

128

129

130 131

- Based upon recognition of other signs with CHARING ONLY • messaging, replacing the arrow that is shown on the comparable R7-8 disabled person parking sign
- While the two hour parking sign performed well, a further test or • consideration of an all green or replacing the blue EV symbol with a black regulatory equivalent would be subject to RWSTC committee consideration.
- The Technical Committee recommended use of green for the symbols over 132 black for consistency in color and simplicity in sign preparation. Based upon the available research and studies conducted the following text is recommended for the MUTCD.
- 134 135 136

138

133

- 137 **RECOMMENDED WORDING**
- 139 **RECOMMENDED WORDING:**
- 140 Note: Proposed changes to the MUTCD are shown in underline red and removed text are shown in 141 strikethrough red. Changes shown following sponsor comments are shown in yellow below
- 142
- 143 Insert the following new text shown in red to Section 2B.46 in paragraph 1 between signs 144 13 and 14:
- 145

146 Section 2B.46 Parking, Standing, and Stopping Signs (R7 and R8 Series)

- 147 Support:
- 148 01 Signs governing the parking, stopping, and standing of vehicles cover a wide variety of
- 149 regulations, and only general guidance can be provided here. The word "standing" when used on
- 150 the R7 and R8 series of signs refers to the practice of a driver keeping the vehicle in a stationary
- 151 position while continuing to occupy the vehicle. Typical examples of parking, stopping, and 152 standing signs and plagues (see Figures 2B-24 and 2B-25) are as follows:
- 153 1. NO PARKING ANY TIME (R7-1);
- 154 2. NO PARKING X:XX AM TO X:XX PM (R7-2, R7-2a);
- 155 3. NO PARKING EXCEPT SUNDAYS AND HOLIDAYS (R7-3);
- 156 4. NO STANDING ANY TIME (R7-4);
- 157 5. XX HOUR PARKING X:XX AM – X:XX PM (R7-5);
- 158 6. NO PARKING LOADING ZONE (R7-6);
- 159 7. NO PARKING BUS STOP (R7-7, R7-107, R7-107a);
- 160 8. RESERVED PARKING for persons with disabilities (R7-8);
- 161 9. VAN ACCESSIBLE (R7-8P);
- 162 10. Pay Station (R7-20);
- 163 11. Pay Parking (R7-21, R7-21a, R7-22);
- 164 12. Parking Permitted X: XX AM TO X: XX PM (R7-23);
- 165 13. Parking Permitted XX HOUR(S) XX AM – XX PM (R7-23a);
- 166 14. RESERVED PARKING for charging electric vehicles (R7-24)

- 167 15. XX HOUR Parking for charging electric vehicles (R7-25) 168 Note: Renumber sequence below 169 16. XX HR PARKING X:XX AM TO X:XX PM (R7-108); 170 17. NO PARKING ANYTIME/XX HOUR PARKING X:XX AM – X:XX PM (R7-200, R7-200a); 171 18. TOW-AWAY ZONE (R7-201P, R7-201aP); 172 19. THIS SIDE OF SIGN (R7-202P); 173 20. EMERGENCY SNOW ROUTE NO PARKING IF OVER XX INCHES (R7-203); 174 21. NO PARKING ON PAVEMENT (R8-1); 175 22. NO PARKING EXCEPT ON SHOULDER (R8-2); 176 23. No Parking (R8-3, R8-3a); 177 24. EXCEPT SUNDAYS & HOLIDAYS (R8-3bP); 178 25. ON PAVEMENT (R8-3cP); 179 26. ON BRIDGE (R8-3dP); 180 27. ON TRACKS (R8-3eP); 181 28. EXCEPT ON SHOULDER (R8-3fP); 182 29. LOADING ZONE (R8-3qP); 183 30. X: XX AM TO X: XX PM (R8-3hP); 184 31. EMERGENCY PARKING ONLY (R8-4); 185 32. NO STOPPING ON PAVEMENT (R8-5); 186 33. NO STOPPING EXCEPT ON SHOULDER (R8-6); and 187 34. EMERGENCY STOPPING ONLY (R8-7). 188 189 Insert the following new text shown in red in Section 2B.47 between paragraphs 17 and 18
- 190

of the MUTCD:

191 Section 2B.47 Design of Parking, Standing, and Stopping Signs

- 192 Support:
- 193 01 Discussions of parking signs and parking regulations in this Section apply not only to parking, 194 but also to standing and stopping.
- 195 Standard:
- 196 02 The legend on parking signs shall state applicable regulations. Parking signs
- 197 (see Figures 2B-24 and 2B-25) shall comply with the standards of shape, color, and 198 location.
- 199 03 Where parking is prohibited at all times or at specific times, the basic design for
- 200 parking signs shall have a red legend and border on a white background (Parking
- 201 Prohibition signs), except that the R8-4 and R8-7 signs and the alternate design for
- 202 the R7-201aP plaque shall have a black legend and border on a white background, and
- 203 the R8-3 sign shall have a black legend and border and a red circle and slash on a
- 204 white background.
- 205 04 Where only limited-time parking or parking in a particular manner are permitted, the signs shall have a green legend and border on a white background (Permissive
- 206
- 207 Parking signs).

- 208 Guidance:
- 209 05 Parking signs should display the following information from top to bottom of the sign, in the 210 order listed:
- 211 A. The restriction or prohibition;
- 212 B. The times of the day that it is applicable, if not at all hours; and
- 213 C. The days of the week that it is applicable, if not every day.

06 If the parking restriction applies to a limited area or zone, the limits of the restriction should be shown by arrows or supplemental plaques. If arrows are used and if the sign is at the end of a parking zone, there should be a single-headed arrow pointing in the direction that the regulation is in effect. If the sign is at an intermediate point in a zone, there should be a double-headed arrow pointing both ways. When a single sign is used at the transition point between two parking zones, it should display a right and left arrow pointing in the direction that the respective

220 restrictions apply.

Where special parking restrictions are imposed during heavy snowfall, Emergency Snow Route
(R7-203) signs (see <u>Figure 2B-24</u>) should be installed. The legend will vary according to the
regulations, but the signs should be vertical rectangles, having a white background with the
upper part of the plate a red background.

225 Standard:

226 08 Where parking spaces that are reserved for persons with disabilities are designated 227 to accommodate wheelchair vans, a VAN ACCESSIBLE (R7-8P) plaque shall be mounted 228 below the R7-8 sign. The R7-8 sign (see <u>Figure 2B-24</u>) shall have a green legend and 229 border and a white wheelchair symbol on a blue square, all on a white background. 230 The R7-8P plaque (see <u>Figure 2B-24</u>) shall have a green legend and border on a white 231 background.

- 232 Option:
- 233 09 To minimize the number of parking signs, blanket regulations that apply to a given district234 may, if legal, be posted at district boundary lines.

235 10 As an alternate to the use of arrows to show designated restriction zones, word messages
236 such as BEGIN, END, HERE TO CORNER, HERE TO ALLEY, THIS SIDE OF SIGN, or BETWEEN
237 SIGNS may be used.

- 11 Where parking is prohibited during certain hours and time-limited parking or parking in a
 particular manner is permitted during certain other time periods, the red Parking Prohibition and
 green Permissive Parking signs may be designed as follows:
- A. Two 12 x 18-inch parking signs may be used with the red Parking Prohibition sign installed above or to the left of the green Permissive Parking sign; or
- B. The red Parking Prohibition sign and the green Permissive Parking sign may be combined (see Figure 2B-24) to form an R7-200 sign on a single 24 x 18-inch sign, or an R7-200a sign on a single 12 x 30-inch sign.
- 246 12 At the transition point between two parking zones, a single sign or two signs mounted side by247 side may be used.
- 248 13 The words NO PARKING may be used as an alternative to the No Parking symbol. The
- supplemental educational plaque, NO PARKING, with a red legend and border on a whitebackground, may be used above signs incorporating the No Parking symbol.

- 14 Alternate designs for the R7-107 sign may be developed such as the R7-107a sign (see<u>Figure</u>
 <u>2B-24</u>). Alternate designs may include, on a single sign, a transit logo, an approved bus symbol,
 a parking prohibition, the words BUS STOP, and an arrow. The preferred bus symbol color is
 black, but other dark colors may be used. Additionally, the transit logo may be displayed on the
 bus face in the appropriate colors instead of placing the logo separately. The reverse side of the
 sign may contain bus routing information.
- 15 To make the parking regulations more effective and to improve public relations by giving a
 definite warning, a TOW-AWAY ZONE (R7-201P) plaque (see Figure 2B-24) may be appended to,
 or incorporated in, any parking prohibition sign. The Tow-Away Zone (R7-201aP) symbol plaque
 may be used instead of the R7-201P word message plaque. The R7-201aP plaque may have
 either a black or red legend and border on a white background.
- 262 Guidance:
- 263 16 If a fee is charged for parking and a midblock pay station is used instead of individual parking

264 meters for each parking space, pay parking signs should be used. Pay Parking (R7-22) signs

265 (see <u>Figure 2B-24</u>) should be used to define the area where the pay station parking applies. Pay

- 266 Station (R7-20) signs (see <u>Figure 2B-24</u>) should be used at the pay station or to direct road 267 users to the pay station.
- 268 Standard:
- 17 If the pay parking is subject to a maximum time limit, the appropriate time limit
 (number of hours or minutes) shall be displayed on the Pay Parking (R7-21 or R7-21a)
 and Pay Station (R7-20) signs.
- 272 <u>Guidance:</u>
- 273 <u>18 Where parking spaces are reserved for charging electric vehicles, a</u>
 274 <u>RESERVED PARKING for charging electric vehicles-(R7-24) sign (see Figure</u>
 275 28 24) should be installed adjacent to the designated space
- 275 <u>2B-24</u>) should be installed adjacent to the designated space.
- 276
- 277 <u>19 Where on-street parking spaces are reserved for charging electric</u>
- 278 <u>vehicles and have time restrictions, XX HOUR Parking for charging electric</u>
- 279 vehicle (R7-25) sign (see Figure 2B-24) should be installed adjacent to the
- 280 designated space.
- 281 NOTE: Re-sequenced the paragraph numbering below
- 282 Option:

283 2018 In rural areas (see Figure 2B-25), the legends NO PARKING ON PAVEMENT (R8-1) or NO 284 STOPPING ON PAVEMENT (R8-5) are generally suitable and may be used. If a roadway has 285 paved shoulders, the NO PARKING EXCEPT ON SHOULDER sign (R8-2) or the NO STOPPING 286 EXCEPT ON SHOULDER sign (R8-6) may be used as these signs would be less likely to cause 287 confusion. The R8-3 symbol sign or the word message NO PARKING (R8-3a) sign may be used to 288 prohibit any parking along a given highway. Word message supplemental plaques may be 289 mounted below the R8-3 or R8-3a sign. These word message supplemental plaques may include 290 legends such as EXCEPT SUNDAYS & HOLIDAYS (R8-3bP), ON PAVEMENT (R8-3cP), ON BRIDGE 291 (R8-3dP), ON TRACKS (R8-3eP), EXCEPT ON SHOULDERS (R8-3fP), LOADING ZONE (with arrow) 292 (R8-3gP), and X:XX AM TO X:XX PM (with arrow) (R8-3hP).

2119 Colors that are in compliance with the provisions of <u>Section 2A.10</u> may be used for color
 coding of parking time limits.

- 295 296 297 298 Guidance:
 - 2220 If colors are used for color coding of parking time limits, the colors green, red, and black should be the only colors that are used.

299300 Add the following graphics to Figure 2B-24:





303 304

302

305

The two following paragraphs are not intended for inclusion in the MUTCD. The two paragraphs are presented for information only as the National Committee and FHWA consider this Technical Committee Recommendation.

309

R7-24 is shown as a vertical rectangular white sign with a green border and the words
"RESERVED PARKING" in green on two lines above a green electric vehicle charging symbol
with the words "CHARGING ONLY" below in green. The sign can be applied to individual
spaces which are accompanied by a charging station for electric vehicles.

R7-25 is shown as a vertical rectangular white sign with a green border and a black letter "P" inside a green circle. The words "2 HOUR" (or alternatively the desired time restriction) in white on a green background as shown. A green electrical vehicle charging station symbol is below the time restriction. The words "CHARGING ONLY" are below in green. The sign can be applied to individual spaces which are accompanied by a charging station for electric vehicles.

- **322** EV TASK FOR VOTE:
- 323 For: unaninous
- 324 **Opposed:**
- 325 Abstentions:
- 326
- 327 RWSTC Vote: 6-27-13
- 328 For: Unanimous
- 329 **Opposed:**
- 330 Abstensions:
- 331332 RWSTC Vote: 1-8-14
- 333 For: Unanimous

334	
335	Council Vote: 1-10-14
336	For: Unanimous
337	Opposed:
338	Abstentions:
339	
340	C:NCUTCD/June 2013/McCourt/Electric Vehicle – EV signs revised 6-27-13, revised 12-
341	22-13 following sponsor comments formatted 1-2-14, approved by RWSTC 1-8-14
342	following sponsor comments, approved by COUNCIL 1-10-14